

EXHIBIT F

1
2 THE OFFICE OF SECRETARY OF STATE
3 STATE OF GEORGIA
4
5
6
7
8

9 IN THE MATTER OF:
10 STATE ELECTION BOARD MEETING
11

12 Wednesday, June 21, 2023
13 Georgia State Capitol, Room 341
14 Atlanta, Georgia
15 9:00 a.m.

16 Volume 2 of 2
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

24 MARY K MCMAHAN, CCR, 2757
25 STEVEN RAY GREEN COURT REPORTING LLC
ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30324
(404) 733-6070

APPEARANCE OF THE PANEL

William Duffey, Chair

Sara Tindall Ghazal

Janice Johnston

Ed Lindsey

Matt Mashburn

Transcript Legend

[sic] - Exactly as said.

(ph) - Exact spelling unknown.

-- Break in speech continuity.

. . . Indicates halting speech, unfinished sentence or omission of word(s) when reading.

Quoted material is typed as spoken.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page:

Response to Fulton County Performance Review 8

Cases Recommended To Be Dismissed 51

Cases Recommended For Letters of Instruction or Referral 113

Reporter's Certificate 241

1 of the elections process to the end of the
2 elections process.

3 Obviously with that, what we'll -- we need
4 to make sure that the poll book is compatible by
5 that point which we're working with our poll book
6 vendor to make sure that we stay up to date with
7 the progress on that. But we're hoping that
8 that's at a point where it is compatible for us
9 to be able to run pilots.

10 So for that what I'm going to do at this
11 point is hand it over to Michael Barnes.

12 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Welcome, Mr. Barnes.

13 **MR. BARNES:** Good morning. Again my name is
14 Michael Barnes. I serve under Blake in the
15 Secretary of State's Office as his deputy
16 director of elections, and I work mainly with the
17 voting systems that we use in the state of
18 Georgia.

19 We have begun the process of interacting
20 with Dominion Suite 5.17 to get a true
21 understanding of what changes we may see between
22 5, 5A, which is what we are currently using in
23 Georgia, as we transition potentially to 5.17.

24 The one good news, I think, from a voter
25 experience, which -- what a Georgia voter will

1 see when they interact with a touchscreen if we
2 transition to 5.17, it's not a big change for
3 what the voter experience will be.

4 However, the majority of the changes are
5 really in the back end of the system, primarily
6 within the election management system. And that
7 is the system that builds the ballots. That's
8 the system that counts the ballots. That's also
9 the system that transfers the information from
10 the election management system to the devices
11 that are used, the BMDs, the scanners themselves.
12 Because unfortunately what we've been -- what
13 we've called this process is, potentially, we
14 call it an upgrade. It's really not an upgrade.

15 This -- even though it starts five -- it
16 says 5.17 and we may use 5.5, this really will
17 require us to fully rebuild the system and that
18 means the election management systems have to be
19 completely rebuilt; the operating systems on
20 those devices have to be renewed, updated to a
21 different version. The back-end application in
22 which these applications sit have to be updated
23 and replaced.

24 So an additional amount of hardware has got
25 to be procured for county use. And I'm not

1 talking about touchscreens and ballot scanners.
2 I'm talking about the CPUs that are placed within
3 the county offices that run the elections
4 process, where the election project sits, where
5 the ballots become tabulated. And we were not
6 anticipating that initially when we began having
7 discussions with Dominion about potential changes
8 in the voting system. But that now is what we
9 are seeing, is that we are going to have to look
10 into going back to the legislature and asking for
11 potential funds to upgrade some of the CPUs that
12 are at the county level. There may be an
13 opportunity us for to -- to reuse some equipment
14 that is already at the place but I'm afraid we're
15 probably not going to be able to do that.

16 In regards to your BMDs, to your scanners,
17 those are still available to be used with the new
18 Democracy Suite but that will require not just a
19 simple install and update and it updates. We're
20 going to actually have to break them all the way
21 back down to the BIOS level. We've got to change
22 a BIOS setting, we've got to adjust operating
23 systems, and then install applications. All of
24 this process takes a significant amount of time
25 per individual device.

1 In the testing that we have done in our
2 office, it takes with our staff about 15 to 18
3 minutes to go through a full installation process
4 on a single BMD. For the installation on an
5 optical scan unit, we're looking at about
6 approximately 20 minutes. But there is some
7 scalability in the optical scan units. We can
8 have multiple optical scans going through an
9 update process in a simultaneous period.

10 The other issue we will have as we take on
11 the process of potentially updating is the
12 equipment is not all in one central location. It
13 is spread out amongst a hundred and fifty-nine
14 counties. So it will be an effort to figure out
15 the logistics of whether the update process will
16 require us to go to each individual county and do
17 the work locally or whether we have to work with
18 the counties to potentially bring equipment back
19 to some sort of locational hub and do the work in
20 a hubbed environment. And all of those decisions
21 are yet to be made.

22 But as Blake alluded to, we are still in the
23 process of learning more about 5.17, learning
24 also what we will need to undertake to train our
25 local officials on the use of 5.17. Is there any

1 additional information that we need to make sure
2 voters are aware of in regards to 5.17?

3 There is some additional hardware that's
4 available in 5.17 that we have not previously
5 used. There is an upgrade to the ballot scanner
6 that is available under 5.17 that does not
7 currently work with five fif -- the 5.5 option
8 that we have. And there are some larger counties
9 in the state that may be interested in
10 potentially procuring this additional hardware
11 because of it's scalability, it's ability to hold
12 more information.

13 So there's a lot of information that we're
14 yet to really fully understand and get the full
15 grasp of. So we want to move in a very
16 meticulous fashion where we learn about this
17 process, where we learn about 5.17, and we can
18 then instruct the county election officials to
19 the best of our ability on what things they will
20 have to do in order to execute elections
21 successfully moving forward.

22 So we're in the process of learning. I wish
23 we were at a state where we knew everything about
24 it at this point, but unfortunately we do not.

25 The biggest surprise that we've encountered

1 so far is the fact that the poll pads are not yet
2 compatible with 5.17. The vendors are working
3 together to resolve that but we don't yet have a
4 timetable on how long that may take. And I'm
5 sort of thankful that we had not gotten too far
6 out ahead of ourselves because we could've really
7 been in a situation where we could've been
8 inadvertently impacted in an upcoming election.
9 So I'm thankful that we have -- are taking this
10 meticulous approach at this point in time to
11 learn as much as we can about 5.17.

12 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Any questions from the board
13 members? Questions?

14 **MR. LINDSEY:** Yes. Before you I have one
15 for that matter.

16 Let's sort of take a timeline. And I want
17 to make sure I understand because I've heard lots
18 of different things here. What is the drop --
19 for want of a better term, drop-dead point in
20 which whatever system we have, we have to have it
21 for the 2024 elections? Because I realize, you
22 know, we're not talking about November.

23 We're -- you know, we have a general
24 election in November. We have primaries and
25 runoffs in May and June -- May, June, and July.

1 We have special elections. We have a
2 presidential primary in March. So in order to
3 have the -- whatever system we have ready and
4 then for you guys to do whatever you need to do
5 to prepare for the election, what is the
6 drop-dead date?

7 **MR. BARNES:** It's getting very close, but I
8 will try my best to give you a timeline answer.
9 The scheduled presidential preference primary is
10 early March. We have to have ballots ready in
11 the counties' hands for mail-out distribution no
12 later than 49 days prior to the election for
13 UOCAVA voting purposes. That means that the
14 election project that has to exist in order for
15 ballots to be generated and ballots printed has
16 to be completed. We always aim to have all
17 election projects for an election completed,
18 especially when there's a 49-day ballot -- ballot
19 window, at 60 days prior to that scheduled
20 election. So we're going to have to have all of
21 the election projects for the state of Georgia
22 finished by middle of January.

23 In order to build those databases, we -- or
24 election project files, we start receiving
25 information from the counties in November of the

1 preceding year. I believe that we will be
2 obtaining from these -- the Democratic and
3 Republican parties somewhere around November of
4 who will be the candidates for their parties on
5 the presidential preference ballot.

6 Once that information's received, we're also
7 receiving information from counties if they plan
8 to have any special elections tied to the
9 presidential preference primary. And we're
10 trying to obtain that information at 90 days or
11 sooner, prior to election so that we have
12 adequate time to put that information, to
13 organize the ballot, to provide counties ample
14 time to proof the ballot to confirm that what is
15 laid out is properly correct.

16 And then once they sign off, we have to
17 finalize it. We have to get the ballots to
18 print. We have to get the election project
19 packaged so it can be delivered to the county so
20 that it can then be installed locally on their
21 election management system so that counties can
22 then begin the process of their logic and
23 accuracy steps prior to the election.

24 So the voting system needs to be in place
25 for a uniform system of voting. In the state of

1 Georgia, we've got to be ready to go in December.

2 **MR. LINDSEY:** Okay. Mr. Chairman, can I ask
3 another one along the same line?

4 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Yes.

5 **MR. LINDSEY:** I'm curious. I'm not sure
6 which one of you sort of commented about Ohio but
7 Ohio is also dealing with the same software
8 updates. And apparently there was a problem with
9 compatibility between the hardware and the
10 software that Ohio was equally concerned about.
11 But -- but they seem to have maybe -- maybe I
12 have it a little bit wrong here. What did they
13 do in order to fix that compatibility problem so
14 that they could have 5.17 in place or at least by
15 a -- pilot program by August. What did they do
16 in order to fix that?

17 **MR. BARNES:** What -- what the various
18 counties in Ohio are doing -- and Ohio's a
19 different system than of course what we do in
20 Georgia. Georgia's a uniform system where every
21 county is using the same types of equipment. In
22 Ohio it's -- it's jurisdictional. Each county
23 decides what they use to service their voters.

24 In those Ohio counties that have been
25 transitioning to 5.17, there are multiple poll

1 book vendors in play. But there are two poll
2 book vendors that are unable to currently work
3 with the 5.17 model. That's KNOWiNK's poll pad
4 and Tenex is the other vendor who is currently
5 unable to work.

6 The jurisdictions in Ohio, what they have
7 opted to do, one county, because they wanted to
8 still maintain the use of their poll pads -- or
9 actually their Tenex devices, have decided to
10 downgrade from 5.17 and actually go back to their
11 5.5 level on their voting machines so that they
12 will be able to still use their poll pads to
13 manage the voter as they come in and participate
14 during the election.

15 The -- another county that has that same
16 dilemma of: We have a set of poll books that are
17 not working currently with our 5.17 environment,
18 what that county has opted to do is to not use
19 their poll pads or their poll books for this
20 election, that they're going to go through
21 another mechanism of preparing the voter access
22 cards that will be then given to the voter that
23 it will allow them to interact with the machine.

24 So they are using a different tool to create
25 the voter access card that'll be presented to the

1 voter and they are not using their normal poll
2 pad procedure.

3 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** How many in Ohio are using
4 the Dominion system?

5 **MR. BARNES:** The last count I got from the
6 vendor yesterday, I believe that that are seven
7 counties in Ohio that have now upgraded to 5.17.

8 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** And of those -- and how many
9 counties are there totally?

10 **MR. BARNES:** I'm not aware of the total
11 number of counties in Ohio?

12 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Do you have a good
13 estimation?

14 **MR. BARNES:** It would be nothing but an
15 estimation and I would hate to be inaccurate on
16 that.

17 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** All right.

18 **MR. BARNES:** They don't have a hundred and
19 fifty-nine counties. I know that.

20 Eighty-eight counties? Thank you.
21 Eighty-eight counties.

22 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** You're off by one but you're
23 forgiven.

24 How many updates has Dominion offered to
25 Dominion users since we first bought the system

1 for use in our elections?

2 **MR. BARNES:** In checking what is currently
3 federally certified under the Dominion -- under
4 the Dominion brand with EAC, I was checking
5 yesterday, there are -- I believe there are four
6 different versions of the 5.5 series. There's A,
7 B, C, and D. The newest version is 5.17.

8 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** And does 5.17 incorporate
9 everything that was in the prior updates?

10 **MR. BARNES:** It incorporates a lot of
11 various things from when the last time Dominion
12 had put a suite together for EAC certification.
13 There have been hardware enhancements. There
14 have been statutorial changes in elections in our
15 state but also in other states that they serve.
16 So vendors tend to put those type of items into
17 their -- into their suites so that they can
18 expand their customer base potentially.

19 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** And of these EAC-certified
20 updates, how many of those did we, Georgia,
21 incorporate onto our machines?

22 **MR. BARNES:** We have only stayed with the
23 5.5A series. There has been -- we -- we went
24 through an update, which was a true update, of
25 one of the applications within the election suite

1 in 2020. And that was on the BMD touchscreen
2 that we had to go through an application update
3 in order to facilitate a two-column screen when
4 we had 21 candidates for a single contest.

5 And so we had to actually upgrade or update
6 our version number from 5.5.10.30 to 5.5.10.32.

7 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Yeah, I'll try to remember
8 all --

9 **MR. BARNES:** Yeah. If you do,
10 congratulations. That's ...

11 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** In these updates, ones that
12 weren't implemented in Georgia and in 5.7[sic] if
13 you can answer this, do any of those address
14 security in making the system more secure?

15 **MR. BARNES:** The five -- the 5.17
16 application, Democracy Suite, was developed in
17 response to those concerns that have been raised
18 over the last two to three years.

19 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** And do you know with more
20 specificity what the concerns are that are
21 addressed in 5.17?

22 **MR. BARNES:** I'm afraid if I start getting
23 into some of those answers that I'm -- I'm
24 opening ourselves up to talking about things that
25 we would be unsafe to disclose.

1 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Well, can you do it in a more
2 general way?

3 **MR. BARNES:** There are -- basically the
4 applicational backgrounds, the backbones of
5 the -- on which the applications are being
6 reinforced and enhanced. And that's -- I think
7 that's about as far as I can go.

8 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** What does reinforced and
9 enhanced mean?

10 **MR. BARNES:** This gets into the coding that
11 you put in place within applications to make
12 applications more secure.

13 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Okay. And is that more
14 secure with respect to internal or external
15 threats?

16 **MR. BARNES:** It's a combination of both.

17 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** And is that being implemented
18 in 5.17 throughout the system for everybody who
19 uses it that's being taught?

20 **MR. BARNES:** Yes.

21 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Okay. Is it your sense that
22 this will be a good update that will be good for
23 the machines that we use in Georgia?

24 **MR. BARNES:** The process of learning about
25 it is absolutely a good step to learn more about.

1 I have been around a lot of voting systems in my
2 time. And sometimes when a new version comes
3 out, it's best to be cautious because there might
4 be another version coming right behind it because
5 sometimes that thing that we thought was -- that
6 fixed everything, turns out it got close but not
7 quite.

8 So I can't say with absolute that, yes, this
9 will be great because it is an element that we
10 need to learn more about it before we move too
11 quickly.

12 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Just one more question on
13 timing. If for the presidential preference we
14 have to be able to build ballots and the system
15 be available for voters, that has to occur by
16 December did you say?

17 **MR. BARNES:** Yes, sir.

18 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Okay. Is it possible to do
19 all the things that you described were necessary
20 to do -- the investigation and state
21 certification and be comfortable with the system,
22 is it possible that that could be done by
23 December?

24 **MR. BARNES:** It is really important for us
25 to see the use of any update to the system, any

1 upgrade, any -- any change to the system in a
2 real election environment. Before we
3 transitioned to our current system, we actually
4 put the system through a piloting effort in 2019.
5 And we did that in an effort to learn not only
6 how to use it, but also how to train officials
7 and train voters on how to use it. And it's very
8 important to have those real election
9 circumstances because things happen in elections
10 that sometimes we don't anticipate. And it's not
11 when the election goes perfectly how does it
12 react, it's how does it react when something
13 happens that we weren't expecting?

14 And that's the real life experience we gain
15 through a pilot. And with a pilot scheduled for
16 November -- of course as long as the poll pad
17 application gets in line and we're able to use
18 it -- if we're not done with a piloting operation
19 until November, I don't know how we could then
20 transition to a statewide implementation in 30
21 days.

22 **JUDGE DUFFEY:** Any other questions?

23 **MR. LINDSEY:** Yeah. Going back for me,
24 Mr. Chairman.

25 Why can we not use Ohio as the piloting

CERTIFICATE

STATE OF GEORGIA

I hereby certify that the foregoing meeting was taken down and was reduced to typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing transcript is a true and correct record given to the best of my ability.

The above certification is expressly withdrawn upon the disassembly or photocopying of the foregoing transcript, unless said disassembly or photocopying is done under the auspices of the undersigned and electronic signature is attached thereon.

I further certify that I am not a relative, employee, attorney, or counsel of any of the parties; nor am I financially interested in the action.

This, the 24th day of July, 2023.

****Mary K McMahan****

Mary K McMahan, CCR, CVR, RPR, FPR
Certified Court Reporter
Certificate Number 2757